

PHILOSOPHY 4360/5360 – METAPHYSICS

Section 001
TTh 3:30-4:45
Hellems 245

Professor Michael Tooley
Hellems, Room 277
Office Hours: TTh 11:00-12:00

Textbook

The text that we will be using in this course is:

Metaphysics – Second Edition, edited by Ronald C. Hoy and L. Nathan Oaklander.

We will also be reading some articles that are not in the above anthology. Copies of those articles will be on a University of Colorado Desire2Learn site for the course. To get electronic copies from that site, proceed as follows:

- (1) Go to the University of Colorado's Desire2Learn website: <https://learn.colorado.edu>
- (2) Login using your CU Login Name and Identkey Password.
- (3) From the list of your courses, select the PHIL 4360 or PHIL 5360 course, depending on which course you are enrolled in.
- (4) Navigate to the list of readings for the course.

Two useful sources of (generally) good overview articles for many of the central topics in this course are the *Encyclopedia of Philosophy*, edited by Paul Edwards (eight volumes, plus a 1996 Supplement, edited by Donald M. Borchert; call number: B41 .E5), and the *Routledge Encyclopedia of Philosophy*, edited by Edward Craig (ten volumes; call number: B51 .R68). (A copy of the former is available in the Reference room of Norlin Library. Copies of the latter are stored offsite.)

Another useful source, though it is still in a somewhat incomplete state, since not all of the articles have yet been written, is the *Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy*, found online at <http://plato.stanford.edu/>

Finally, there will be handouts for some topics. These are listed below under “Topics and Readings”, and are available on the following website:

<http://spot.colorado.edu/~tooley/Handouts4360-5360.html>

Classes

1. This course is both an upper level undergraduate course and a graduate course. If one is an undergraduate, the plus side of this is that one is in a class with students who typically have a strong background in philosophy, and thus who may very well advance some ideas that you may not have encountered before, along with interesting objections to some of my arguments.
2. But there is also a downside, in that if one is an undergraduate, one may be more reluctant to ask questions, or raise objections, for fear of being thought naïve.
3. This, I think, is a serious danger, for my experience has been that those who progress most rapidly in their philosophical development are those who are philosophically fearless, those who

are willing to jump into discussions without being afraid that they may put forward a view that others may view as naïve, or unsound.

4. My way of attempting to deal with this problem will be to call on two or three people, chosen randomly from the class list, before throwing discussion open to others. When you are called upon, if the question is one on which you do not really have any opinion at all, it is fine for you simply to say so. But my hope is that, otherwise, you will not be afraid to put forward a view, however tentative it may be.

5. Classes will take the form of lectures with breaks for discussion of the material that has just been presented, both to consider objections, and to ensure that the fundamental ideas are completely clear.

6. In those discussions, I want to focus first of all on whether all of the ideas are completely clear. Once that is the case, we can then move on to focus on objections and counterarguments.

7. It is very important that you come to class prepared to take part in those discussions. This means that you should **do the readings in advance**, and then **think about the issues and arguments**, so that when an opportunity arises in class to set out an opinion on the issue in question, or to critically evaluate an argument, you are prepared to contribute to the discussion.

8. Finally, you will probably find that I have fairly strong opinions on many philosophical matters, especially in the area of metaphysics. It is very important that you not be intimidated by that fact, and that you not be afraid to disagree!

Required Work

The required work for the course will consist of two essays and a final examination. Each essay will count for **one-third** of your final grade, and the final examination will count for the other **one-third**.

The Essay Assignments

1. Detailed information about the essay assignments, including **a list of recommended topics**, can be found at the following web site:

<http://spot.colorado.edu/~tooley/EssayAssignments4360-5360.html>

2. One can write on topics other than those listed, but other possible topics should be **discussed in advance with me**, to make sure that the topic is not a problematic one. (Some topics that may seem appealing can turn out to be far too difficult.)

3. Due Dates for the Essays

First Essay: **Tuesday, October 29**

Second Essay: **Tuesday, December 10**

4. The Length of the Essays

For **undergraduate students**, each essay should be about **1250-1500 words** in length.

For **graduate students**, each essay should be about **2000-2500 words** in length.

Final Examination

The final examination is a two and one-half hour, closed book, essay-style, examination, and is scheduled for **Wednesday, December 18, 1:30 – 4:00 p.m., in Hellems 245.**

Class Web Site

All course materials can be found online on the Philosophy 4360/5360 class website:
<http://spot.colorado.edu/~tooley/Philosophy4360-5360.html>

Handouts

For a number of topics, there will be important handouts. These are listed below, and all of those handouts are available on the class website.

Topics and Readings

I. What Is Metaphysics?

"Introduction", Ronald C. Hoy and Nathan Oaklander, *Metaphysics*, pp. 1-4.

Handouts: (1) "Some Metaphysical Questions"
 (2) "Methods in Metaphysics"

II. Identity and Persistence

"Introduction to Part II - Identity", Ronald C. Hoy and L. Nathan Oaklander, *Metaphysics*, pp. 87-9.

"Of Identity and Diversity", Thomas Hobbes, *Metaphysics*, pp. 121-24.

"Of Identity and Diversity", John Locke, *Metaphysics*, pp. 124-34.

"Problems of Identity", Roderick Chisholm, *Metaphysics*, pp. 148-157.

"Identity Through Time", David Armstrong, *Metaphysics*, pp. 158-65.

"Three-Dimensionalism vs. Four-Dimensionalism", John Hawthorne, in Theodore Sider, John Hawthorne, and Dean W. Zimmerman (ed.), *Contemporary Debates in Metaphysics* (Oxford, Blackwell Publishing, 2008), 263-82. (Desire2Learn)

Handouts: (1) "Identity Defined"
 (2) "The Analyzability of Unity Relations"
 (3) "Diachronic Unity"

III. Personal Identity

"Of Identity and on Mr. Locke's Theory of Personal Identity", Thomas Reid, *Metaphysics*, pp. 135-40.

"On Identity and Personal Identity", David Hume, *Metaphysics*, pp. 140-8.

"The Third Night: The Bodily Theory of Personal Identity", John Perry, *Metaphysics*, pp. 165-70.

"Personal Identity", Derek Parfit, *Metaphysics*, pp. 171-83.

"Friends and Future Selves", Jennifer E. Whiting, *Metaphysics*, pp. 184-201

"The Self as a Private Object", Thomas Nagel, *Metaphysics*, pp. 201-09.

Handout: "Personal Identity – Main Alternatives"

IV. The Nature of the Mind

"Introduction to Part III - Mind", Ronald C. Hoy and L. Nathan Oaklander, *Metaphysics*, pp. 213-5.

"Phaedo", Plato, *Metaphysics*, pp. 90-109.

"On the Soul", Aristotle, *Metaphysics*, pp. 216-28.

"Meditations on First Philosophy", René Descartes, *Metaphysics*, pp. 229-41.

"The Nature of the Mind", David Armstrong, *Metaphysics*, pp. 270-7.

"Philosophy and Our Mental Life", Hilary Putnam, *Metaphysics*, pp. 277-85.

Handout: "Swinburne's Argument"

V. Consciousness, and the Existence of Emergent, Sensuous Qualities

"What Is It Like to Be a Bat?", Thomas Nagel, *Metaphysics*, pp. 285-93.

"Epiphenomenal Qualia", Frank Jackson, *Metaphysics*, pp. 293-300.

"Reduction, Qualia, and the Direct Introspection of the Brain", Paul M. Churchland, *Metaphysics*, pp. 300-312.

"Dualism and the Arguments against Neuroscientific Progress", Patricia S. Churchland, *Metaphysics*, pp. 320-41.

"Time, Consciousness, and the Knowledge Argument", John Perry, *Metaphysics*, pp. 76-83.

"Reductionism and the Irreducibility of Consciousness", John R. Searle, *Metaphysics*, pp. 312-320.

"Zombies v. Materialists", Robert Kirk and J. E. R. Squires, *Proceedings of the Aristotelian Society, Supplementary Volumes* 48, 1974, pp. 135-63. (Desire2Learn)

VI. Intentionality and the Mind

"The Distinction Between Mental and Physical Phenomena", Franz Brentano, *Metaphysics*, pp. 216-24.

"Intentional Systems", Daniel C. Dennett, *Metaphysics*, pp. 225-33.

Handout: "Intentionality"

VII. Is Change Possible?

"Being Is Not Temporal", Parmenides, *Metaphysics*, pp. 8-10.

"A Contemporary Exposition of Zeno's Paradoxes", Wesley C. Salmon, *Metaphysics*, pp. 11-13.

Handout: "Achilles and the Tortoise Calculation"

VIII. Time: Realist Versus Reductionist Views

"Introduction to Part I - Time", Ronald C. Hoy and L. Nathan Oaklander, *Metaphysics*, pp. 5-7.

"Time Is Absolute", Isaac Newton, *Metaphysics*, pp. 29-33.

"What Is Time?", St. Augustine, *Metaphysics*, pp. 21-28.

"Time Is a Measure of Change", Aristotle, *Metaphysics*, pp. 14-20.

"Time Without Change", Sydney Shoemaker, *Journal of Philosophy*, 66 (1969), pp. 363-81.
(Desire2Learn)

IX. Time: Static Versus Dynamic Views

"Time Is the Flux of Duration", Henri Bergson, *Metaphysics*, pp. 34-43.

"Time Is Not Real", J. M. E. McTaggart, *Metaphysics*, pp. 44-55.

"The Myth of Passage", Donald Williams, *Metaphysics*, pp. 55-64.

"McTaggart, Fixity, and Coming True", D. H. Mellor, *Metaphysics*, pp. 65-76.

"Time, Consciousness, and the Knowledge Argument", John Perry, *Metaphysics*, pp. 76-83.

Handout: "McTaggart's Argument"

X. A Causal Theory of the Direction of Time

Chapter 9 of *Time, Tense, and Causation*, Michael Tooley. (Desire2Learn)

Handout: "A Causal Theory of Time"

XI. Laws of Nature: Realist Versus Reductionist Views

"Laws of Nature", Fred I. Dretske, *Philosophy of Science*, 44 (1977), pp. 248-68.
(E-Reserve)

"The Nature of Laws", Michael Tooley, *Canadian Journal of Philosophy*, 7 (1977), pp. 667-98.
(E-Reserve)

"Humean Supervenience", Barry Loewer, *Philosophical Topics*, 24 (1996), pp. 101-27. (E-Reserve)

"The Non-Governing Conception of Laws of Nature", Helen Beebe, *Philosophy and Phenomenological Research*, 61 (2000), pp. 571-594. (Desire2Learn)

Handouts: (1) "Laws of Nature - 1"

(2) "Laws of Nature - 2"

XII. Causation: Realist Versus Reductionist Views

"Causation: Reductionism Versus Realism", Michael Tooley, pp. 172-92, in Ernest Sosa and Michael Tooley (ed.), *Causation*, (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1993). (Desire2Learn)

"Causation and Laws of Nature", Jonathan Schaffer, in Theodore Sider, John Hawthorne, and Dean W. Zimmerman (ed.), *Contemporary Debates in Metaphysics* (Oxford, Blackwell Publishing, 2008), 82-107. (Desire2Learn)

Handout: "Schaffer and Causation"

XIII. Freedom of the Will: Logical Fatalism

"Introduction to Part IV - Freedom", Ronald C. Hoy and L. Nathan Oaklander, *Metaphysics*, pp. 345-47.

"Fatalism, Voluntary Action, and Choice", Aristotle, *Metaphysics*, pp. 348-52.

"Freedom and the New Theory of Time", L. Nathan Oaklander, *Metaphysics*, pp. 355-65.

XIV. Freedom of the Will: Theological Fatalism

"Whether There Is Anything Voluntary in Human Acts?", Thomas Aquinas, *Metaphysics*, pp. 366-7.

"God's Foreknowledge and Human Freedom", St. Augustine, *Metaphysics*, pp. 368-71.

"Predestination, Divine Foreknowledge and Human Freedom", William L. Rowe, *Metaphysics*, pp. 371-80.

"Time, Truth, Actuality, and Causation: On the Impossibility of Divine Foreknowledge", Michael Tooley, *European Journal for the Philosophy of Religion*, 2/1, 2010, 143-61. (Desire2Learn)

XV. Freedom of the Will: Freedom and Causal Determinism

"On Liberty and Necessity", David Hume, *Metaphysics*, pp. 381-90.

"Of the Liberty of Moral Agents", Thomas Reid, *Metaphysics*, pp. 391-96.

"Free Will", G. E. Moore, *Metaphysics*, pp. 396-401.

"Human Freedom and the Self", Roderick Chisholm, *Metaphysics*, pp. 401-8.

"Alternate Possibilities and Moral Responsibility", Harry Frankfurt, *Metaphysics*, pp. 408-414.

"Responsibility, Luck, and Chance: Reflections on Free Will and Indeterminism", Robert Kane, *Metaphysics*, pp. 415-29

"A Hearing for Libertarianism", Daniel C. Dennett, *Metaphysics*, pp. 429-52

"Freedom and Constraint by Norms", Robert Brandom, *Metaphysics*, pp. 452-62.

XVI. Realism Versus Idealism

"A Treatise Concerning the Principles of Human Knowledge", George Berkeley, *Metaphysics*, pp. 544-64.

"An Enquiry Concerning Human Understanding", David Hume, *Metaphysics*, pp. 564-82.

"Philosophy and the Scientific Image of Man", Wilfrid Sellars, *Metaphysics*, pp. 603-27.

"Ontological Relativity", Willard V. O. Quine, *Metaphysics*, pp. 627-44.

"The World Well Lost", Richard Rorty, *Metaphysics*, pp. 645-54.

"Yes, Virginia, There Is a Real World", William P. Alston, *Metaphysics*, pp. 654-68.

Contacting Me, Especially Concerning Urgent Matters

People tend to rely rather heavily on e-mail. This is not the best idea in my case, since I sometimes get absorbed in my research, and then I do not check my e-mail on a regular basis. In addition, many matters can be dealt with *much* more quickly and effectively by a conversation. **So please contact me by telephone**, rather than by email, especially if it is a matter of some urgency.

My home phone is (303) 541-0933, and you will almost always be able to reach me between the hours of 10 a.m. and 10 p.m. Mondays, Wednesdays, and Fridays, and generally on weekends, while on Tuesdays and Thursdays, when I am teaching, you can reach me in the evenings.

Course Plagiarism Policy

Each essay that you submit should be your own original work.

The use of essays and other material downloaded from the Internet is obviously a serious case of plagiarism. But, in general, any substantial use of material from any source must be clearly acknowledged, and any ideas should be expressed in one's own words.

A first violation of this plagiarism policy, the University Honor Code, and/or the Honor Code Pledge shown below will result in a grade of zero for the relevant piece of work, and, in accordance with University requirements, will have to be reported. In addition, if that first violation is especially serious – such as the copying of a whole document – the result will be a failing grade for the course as a whole.

A second violation will result in a failing grade for the course as a whole.

Honor Code Pledge

“On my honor, as a University of Colorado at Boulder student, I have neither given nor received unauthorized assistance on this work.”

Syllabus Statements Recommended by the Office of Academic Affairs

1. The Boulder Provost’s Disability Task Force Recommended Syllabus Statement

If you qualify for accommodations because of a disability, please submit to your professor a letter from Disability Services in a timely manner (for exam accommodations provide your letter at least one week prior to the exam) so that your needs can be addressed. Disability Services determines accommodations based on documented disabilities. Contact Disability Services at 303-492-8671 or by e-mail at dsinfo@colorado.edu.

If you have a temporary medical condition or injury, see Temporary Injuries under Quick Links at Disability Services website (<http://disabilityservices.colorado.edu/>) and discuss your needs with your professor.

2. Statement Concerning Religious Observances

Campus policy regarding religious observances requires that faculty make every effort to deal reasonably and fairly with all students who, because of religious obligations, have conflicts with scheduled exams, assignments or required attendance. In this class, if you have a religious observance that conflicts with a class or with the final exam, please contact me at the beginning of the semester so that alternative arrangements can be made. See full details at http://www.colorado.edu/policies/fac_relig.html

3. Statement Concerning Classroom Behavior

Students and faculty each have responsibility for maintaining an appropriate learning environment. Those who fail to adhere to such behavioral standards may be subject to discipline. Professional courtesy and sensitivity are especially important with respect to individuals and topics dealing with differences of race, color, culture, religion, creed, politics, veteran's status, sexual orientation, gender, gender identity and gender expression, age, disability, and nationalities. Class rosters are provided to the instructor with the student's legal name. I will gladly honor your request to address you by an alternate name or gender pronoun. Please advise me of this preference early in the semester so that I may make appropriate changes to my records. See policies at

<http://www.colorado.edu/policies/classbehavior.html> and at

http://www.colorado.edu/studentaffairs/judicialaffairs/code.html#student_code

4. Recommended Statement from the Office of Discrimination and Harassment

The University of Colorado Boulder (CU-Boulder) is committed to maintaining a positive learning, working, and living environment. The University of Colorado does not discriminate on the basis of race, color, national origin, sex, age, disability, creed, religion, sexual orientation, or veteran status in admission and access to, and treatment and employment in, its educational programs and activities. (Regent Law, Article 10, amended 11/8/2001). CU-Boulder will not tolerate acts of discrimination or harassment based upon Protected Classes or related retaliation against or by any employee or student. For purposes of this CU-Boulder policy, "Protected Classes" refers to race, color, national origin, sex, pregnancy, age, disability, creed, religion, sexual orientation, gender identity, gender expression, or veteran status. Individuals who believe they have been discriminated against should contact the Office of Discrimination and Harassment (ODH) at 303-492-2127 or the Office of Student Conduct (OSC) at 303-492-5550. Information about the ODH, the above referenced policies, and the campus resources available to assist individuals regarding discrimination or harassment can be obtained at <http://hr.colorado.edu/dh/>

5. Recommended Statement on Academic Honesty and Integrity

The Boulder campus has a student Honor Code and individual faculty members are expected to familiarize themselves with its tenets and follow the approved procedures should violations be perceived. The campus has been working diligently to make this process work better and to provide guidance on 'gray areas' to be helpful to both faculty and students at the Honor website. The Honor Council recommended syllabus statement:

All students of the University of Colorado at Boulder are responsible for knowing and adhering to the academic integrity policy of this institution. Violations of this policy may include: cheating, plagiarism, aid of academic dishonesty, fabrication, lying, bribery, and threatening behavior. All incidents of academic misconduct shall be reported to the Honor Code Council (honor@colorado.edu; 303-735-2273). Students who are found to be in violation of the academic integrity policy will be subject to both academic sanctions from the faculty member and non-

academic sanctions (including but not limited to university probation, suspension, or expulsion). Other information on the Honor Code can be found at

<http://www.colorado.edu/policies/honor.html> and at

<http://honorcode.colorado.edu>