

## Handout 1: The Dilemma of Freedom and Foreknowledge

### I. Five Principles that Lie Behind the Argument

**Knowledge Entails Truth (KET)**: Necessarily, if someone knows that a person S will perform action A at time t, then S performs A at t.

Slogan: “If you know something, then it must be true.”

**Divine Foreknowledge of Action (DFA)**: Necessarily, if S performs A at t, then at every time prior to t, God knows at that time that S will perform A at t.

Slogan: “God knows everything will you do long before you do it.”

**The Fixity of the Past (FP)**: Necessarily, if event E occurs at time t, then after t it is not within anyone’s power to prevent E’s occurrence at t.

Slogan: “You can’t change the past.”

**Transfer of Powerlessness (TP)**: Necessarily, if (i) it is never within S’s power to prevent event E from occurring, and (ii) E’s occurrence logically entails S’s doing A at t, then it is never within S’s power to avoid doing A at t.

Slogan: “Whatever is necessarily connected with what is necessary in some sense, is itself necessary in that sense” (Plantinga, “On Ockham’s Way Out,” p. 238).

**Freedom Requires the Power to Do Otherwise (FRP)**: Necessarily, if it is never within S’s power to avoid doing A at t, then S does not do A freely.

Slogan: “Freedom requires the ability to do otherwise.”

## II. The Argument

1. I clap my hands at noon today.

[supposition]

2. Necessarily, if I clap my hands at noon today, then God knew in 1000 A.D. that I would clap my hands at noon today.

[instance of DFA]

3. If God knew in 1000 A.D. that I would clap my hands at noon today, then it was never within my power to prevent God's knowing in 1000 A.D. that I would clap my hands at noon today.

[instance of FP]

4. Therefore, it was never within my power to prevent God's knowing in 1000 A.D. that I would clap my hands at noon today.

[from lines 2, 3, and 4]

5. God's knowing in 1000 A.D. that I would clap my hands at noon today entails that I clap my hands today at noon.

[instance of KET]

6. If (4) and (5), then it was never within my power to avoid clapping my hands at noon today.

[instance of TP]

7. If it was never within my power to avoid clapping my hands at noon today, then I did not clap my hands freely.

[instance of FRP]

8. Therefore, I did not clap my hands freely.

[from lines 4, 5, 6, and 7]