

Fourth Meeting: The Survival of Death

The Problem of Personal Identity Over Time

The Question of Personal Identity

Under what conditions is a person existing at one time numerically identical to a person existing at another time?

Theories of Personal Identity

a person P1 existing at time t1 is numerically identical to a person P2 existing at time t2 if and only if _____ P1 _____ P2 _____ .

The Soul Theory of Personal Identity

STPI: a person P1 existing at time t1 is numerically identical to a person P2 existing at time t2 if and only if P1 is the same soul as P2.

Alleged Problems:

- leads to skepticism about personal identity
- no good reason to believe in souls

The Bodily Theory of Personal Identity

BTPI: a person P1 existing at time t1 is numerically identical to a person P2 existing at time t2 if and only if P1 is the same body as P2.

Alleged Problems:

- incompatible with body-switching
- brain transplant cases

The Psychological Theory of Personal Identity

PTPI: a person P1 existing at time t1 is numerically identical to a person P2 existing at time t2 if and only if P2 is able to remember the thoughts and feelings of P1.

D1. Subject S *actually remembers* having experience E =df. S seems to remember having E and S really had E.

D2. Subject S *actually remembers* having experience E =df. S seems to remember having E and S's seeming to remember having E depends causally on the occurrence of E.

Alleged Problems:

- the duplication problem