

Slides for Chapter 8: Open Economy Models for Competitive Economies

Copyright: James R. Markusen University of Colorado, Boulder

8.1 Small open economy

Small open economy 2x2 (two goods, two factors) in which the rest of the world is not explicitly modeled.

Known as the “small-country assumption”: the country faces fixed world prices

Trading opportunities are summarized by simple functions which allow the economy to transform one good (an export) into another (an import).

The “technology” of these functions represents world prices. We will assume that these technologies or price ratios are fixed in this model.

Country exports X_1 in exchange for X_2 (activities E1, M2)

We will allow for the fact that some policy or endowment change could actually reverse the direction of trade by specifying (initially inactive) functions that transform goods in the opposite direction.

Initial data, in which 50 units of good X_1 are exchanged for 50 units of good X_2 at an implicit price ratio of $p_1/p_2 = 1$.

Production Sectors

Consumer

Markets	x1	x2	E1	M2	W	CONS
P1	150		-50		-100	
P2		50		50	-100	
PL	-135	-5				140
PK	-15	-45				60
PW					200	-200
PFX			50	-50		

Technology parameters are specified in these functions that allow the modeler to change the terms of trade.

PARAMETERS

PE2	Export price of good 2,
PM1	Import price of good 1,
PE1	Export price of good 1,
PM2	Import price of good 2,
TM2	Import tariff for good 2;

PE1 = 1;

PM2 = 1;

PE2 = 0.999;

PM1 = 1.001;

E1 and M2 production activities that are the initially active trade links.

Small trade costs on inactive links prevent model degeneracy and “round tripping”.

If all prices = 1, then if $E1 = M2 = 1$ is a solution, then so is $E1 = 2, M1 = 1, M2 = 1$.

While we could specify this activity as directly transforming X_1 into X_2 , in more complicated models it proves useful to define another good which we will call “foreign exchange” and whose price is denoted PFX.

All trade is mediated through the “foreign exchange market”.

Thus activity E1 transforms X_1 into foreign exchange and M2, the import activity for good 2, transforms foreign exchange into imports of good 2.

There are four trade activities as just noted.

$$\text{PRF_E1} \dots 0 * P1 =G= 50 * \text{PFX} * \text{PE1} ;$$

$$\text{PRF_E2} \dots 50 * P2 =G= 50 * \text{PFX} * \text{PE2} ;$$

$$\text{PRF_M1} \dots 50 * \text{PFX} * \text{PM1} =G= 50 * P1 ;$$

$$\text{PRF_M2} \dots 50 * \text{PFX} * \text{PM2} =G= 50 * P2 ;$$

The equation for “foreign exchange is the trade balance condition:

$$\text{MKT_PFX} \dots 50 * \text{E2} * \text{PE2} + 50 * \text{E1} * \text{PE1} =G= 50 * \text{PM2} * \text{M2} + 50 * \text{PM1} * \text{M1} ;$$

\$TITLE M8-1.GMS: Small open economy 2x2

* *strips out trade costs and tariffs for simplicity of exposition*

\$ONTEXT

*CALIBRATION: country exports X1, imports X2
in free-trade SOE*

	Production Sectors					Consumer	
Markets		X1	X2	E1	M2	W	CONS
P1		150		-50		-100	
P2			50		50	-100	
PL		-135	-5				140
PK		-15	-45				60
PW						200	-200
PFX				50	-50		

\$OFFTEXT

* *the first four parameters allow changes in (exogenous) world prices*

PARAMETERS

PE2	Export price of good 2	/0.999/
PM1	Import price of good 1	/1.001/

PE1	Export price of good 1	/1/
PM2	Import price of good 2	/1/;

NONNEGATIVE VARIABLES

X1	Activity level for sector X1
X2	Activity level for sector X2
E1	Activity level for sector E1
E2	Activity level for sector E2
M1	Activity level for sector M1
M2	Activity level for sector M2
W	Activity level for sector W
P1	Price index for commodity X
P2	Price index for commodity Y
PL	Price index for primary factor L
PK	Price index for primary factor K
PW	Price index for welfare (consumer price index)
PFX	Real exchange rate index
CONS	Income definition for CONS;

EQUATIONS

PRF_X1	Zero profit for sector X1
PRF_X2	Zero profit for sector X2
PRF_E1	Zero profit for sector E1
PRF_E2	Zero profit for sector E2

PRF_M1 Zero profit for sector M1
 PRF_M2 Zero profit for sector M2
 PRF_W Zero profit for sector W

MKT_X1 Supply-demand balance for commodity X1
 MKT_X2 Supply-demand balance for commodity X2
 MKT_PFX Supply-demand balance for commodity PFX
 MKT_L Supply-demand balance for primary factor L
 MKT_K Supply-demand balance for primary factor K
 MKT_W Supply-demand balance for aggregate demand

I_CONS Income definition for CONS;

* *Zero profit conditions*

PRF_X1.. $150 * PL^{0.9} * PK^{0.1} = G = 150 * P1;$

PRF_X2.. $50 * PL^{0.1} * PK^{0.9} = G = 50 * P2;$

PRF_E1.. $50 * P1 = G = 50 * PFX * PE1;$

PRF_E2.. $50 * P2 = G = 50 * PFX * PE2;$

PRF_M1.. $50 * PFX * PM1 = G = 50 * P1;$

PRF_M2.. $50 * PFX * PM2 = G = 50 * P2;$

PRF_W.. $100 * P1^{**0.5} * P2^{**0.5} =G= 100 * PW;$

* *Market clearance conditions*

MKT_X1.. $150 * X1 + 50 * M1 =G= 50 * E1 + 100 * W * PW / P1;$

MKT_X2.. $50 * X2 + 50 * M2 =G= 50 * E2 + 100 * W * PW / P2 ;$

MKT_PFX.. $50 * E2 * PE2 + 50 * E1 * PE1 =G= 50 * PM2 * M2 + 50 * PM1 * M1;$

MKT_W.. $200 * W =G= CONS / PW;$

MKT_L.. $140 =G= 135 * X1 * P1 / PL + 5 * X2 * P2 / PL;$

MKT_K.. $60 =G= 15 * X1 * P1 / PK + 45 * X2 * P2 / PK;$

* *Income balance*

I_CONS.. $CONS =E= 140 * PL + 60 * PK;$

MODEL SOE1 /PRF_X1.X1, PRF_X2.X2, PRF_E1.E1, PRF_E2.E2,
 PRF_M1.M1, PRF_M2.M2, PRF_W.W,
 MKT_X1.P1, MKT_X2.P2, MKT_PFX.PFX, MKT_L.PL,
 MKT_K.PK, MKT_W.PW, I_CONS.CONS /;

* *set SOE values:*

X1.L =1;

X2.L =1;

E2.L =0;

M1.L =0;

E1.L =1;

M2.L =1;

W.L =1;

P1.L =1;

P2.L =1;

PFX.L =1;

PK.L =1;

PL.L =1;

CONS.L =200;

* *choose the real consumer price index as numeraire*

PW.FX =1;

* *check for calibration and starting-value errors*

SOE1.ITERLIM = 0;

SOLVE SOE1 USING MCP;

SOE1.ITERLIM = 2000;

SOLVE SOE1 USING MCP;

** counterfactual: a terms-of-trade improvement*

PE1 = 1.2;

PM1 = 1.21;

SOE1.ITERLIM = 2000;

SOLVE SOE1 USING MCP;

8.2 Small open economy: tariffs versus trade costs

Zero-profit conditions for trade activities

- PFX - price of a unit of “foreign exchange”
 TC - gross real trade cost: 1 + the trade-cost rate
 TR - gross tariff: 1 + the ad valorem tariff rate

TC = TR = 1: costless trade: tariffs, trade costs *appear* symmetric

$$\text{PRF_E1} \dots 50 * P1 =G= 50 * \text{PFX} * \text{PE1};$$

$$\text{PRF_E2} \dots 50 * P2 =G= 50 * \text{PFX} * \text{PE2};$$

$$\text{PRF_M1} \dots 50 * \text{PFX} * \text{PM1} * \text{TC} * \text{TR} =G= 50 * P1;$$

$$\text{PRF_M2} \dots 50 * \text{PFX} * \text{PM2} * \text{TC} * \text{TR} =G= 50 * P2;$$

TC and TR appear the same way in the pricing equations. However, they are quite different from one another.

Modeling a tariff that is costlessly collected and redistributed to consumers lump sum.

Recall that TR is defined as the gross tariff (one plus the ad valorem rate), so $(TR - 1)$ is the tariff rate. The tariff revenue from equation PRF_M1 is:

$$[50 * PFX * PM2] * (TR - 1) * M2$$

The term in brackets [] is the cost of 50 units (the benchmark value) of imports of good 2, $(TR - 1)$ is the tariff rate, and M2 is the activity level, calibrated at one initially.

The assumption that the tariff can be costlessly redistributed means that this amount must be entered in the consumer's budget constraint: $\text{Income} = \text{factor income} + \text{tariff revenue}$.

$$\text{CONS} = E = 140 * P_L + 60 * P_K + 50 * P_{FX} * P_{M2} * (TR - 1) * M_2 ;$$

Modeling an “iceberg” trade cost. Assume that the trade cost is paid in units of the good itself.

This is sometimes referred to as “iceberg trade costs”. Some of the good “melts” in transit and less arrives than is shipped.

Let p^* and M be the price received by the exporter and M be the number of units shipped.

Then the price paid by the importer is (p^*TC) . The quantity received by the importer is (M/TC) : the quantity that arrives unmelted.

Note that revenue received by the exporter and paid by the importer are the same: the payments do and must balance.

$$p^*M = (p^*TC)(M/TC)$$

The trade cost obviously does not generate any revenue and does not become a term in the consumer's budget constraint.

However, it reappears in the model in the supply = demand equations for the two goods: the amount entered is the amount received, not the amount shipped.

The market-clearing conditions for the two goods are production plus imports (received) minus exports equal domestic demand.

$$150 * X1 + 50 * M1 / TC = G = 50 * E1 + 100 * W * PW / P1$$

$$50 * X2 + 50 * M2 / TC = G = 50 * E2 + 100 * W * PW / P2$$

Finally, there is a market-clearing condition for foreign exchange that determines its price (PFX):

earnings from exports = import costs

$$50 * E2 * PE2 + 50 * E1 * PE1 = G = 50 * PM2 * M2 + 50 * PM1 * M1 ;$$

Counter-factual: show the welfare effects of a tariff versus a real trade costs.

Two sets are defined:

I will loop over values of trade costs or tariffs

J will denote the tariff and trade cost scenarios respectively.

Then some two-dimensional parameters are defined in order to extract some results after solving.

The * in RESULTS(I, *) is called a “wild card” and its use should be obvious below.

```
SETS I indexes 25 different gross cost levels      /I1*I25/
      J indexes 2 scenarios: 1 = tar 2 = trade cost /J1*J2/;
```

PARAMETERS

```

RATE ( I )
WELFARE ( I , J )
IMP2 ( I , J )
TRATE ( I , J )
TCOST ( I , J )
RESULTS ( I , * ) ;

```

Then there is the double loop, the inner loop over I sets the cost rate, starting at 1.

For J = 1, the rate is a tariff, for J = 2, the rate is a trade costs.

```

LOOP ( J ,
LOOP ( I ,

TC = 1 ; TR = 1 ;
RATE ( I ) = 1 + .05 * ORD ( I ) - 0.05 ;
TR$ ( ORD ( J ) EQ 1 ) = RATE ( I ) ;
TC$ ( ORD ( J ) EQ 2 ) = RATE ( I ) ;

```

The *left-hand* exception operator \$

```
TR$(ORD(J) EQ 1) = RATE(I);
```

is read “set the parameter TR equal to RATE if the ordinal value of J is equal to one, otherwise leave TR unchanged from it’s existing value”.

For future reference, the meaning is different if the exception operator is on *the right-hand* side.

```
TR= RATE(I)$ (ORD(J) EQ 1);
```

is read “set the tariff TR equal to RATE if the ordinal value of J is equal to one, otherwise set TR equal to *zero*”. This is something quite different!

The parameter $\text{IMP}(I, J)$ extracts the equilibrium value of exports in the two scenarios.

```
SOLVE ALGEBRAIC USING MCP;
```

```
WELFARE(I, J) = W.L;  
IMP2(I, J) = M2.L/TC;
```

```
);
```

```
);
```

```
RESULTS(I, "RATE") = RATE(I);  
RESULTS(I, "WELTR") = WELFARE(I, "J1");  
RESULTS(I, "WELTC") = WELFARE(I, "J2");  
RESULTS(I, "IMP2TR") = IMP2(I, "J1");  
RESULTS(I, "IMP2TC") = IMP2(I, "J2");
```

```
DISPLAY RESULTS;
```

\$TITLE M8-2.GMS: Small open economy 2x2

* *contrasts tariffs versus (iceberg) trade costs*

\$ONTEXT

*CALIBRATION: country exports X1, imports X2
in free-trade benchmark*

	<i>Production Sectors</i>					<i>Consumer</i>
<i>Markets</i>	<i>X1</i>	<i>X2</i>	<i>E1</i>	<i>M2</i>	<i>W</i>	<i>CONS</i>
<i>P1</i>	150		-50		-100	
<i>P2</i>		50		50	-100	
<i>PL</i>	-135	-5				140
<i>PK</i>	-15	-45				60
<i>PW</i>					200	-200
<i>PFX</i>			50	-50		

\$OFFTEXT

* *the first four parameters allow changes in (exogenous) world*

PARAMETERS

PE2	Export price of good 2	/0.999/
PM1	Import price of good 1	/1.001/

PE1	Export price of good 1	/1/
PM2	Import price of good 2	/1/
TR	Import tariff (gross basis)	/1/
TC	Trade costs (gross basis)	/1/
CONSX1	Consumption of X1	
CONSX2	Consumption of X2;	

NONNEGATIVE VARIABLES

X1	Activity level for sector X1
X2	Activity level for sector X2
E1	Activity level for sector E1
E2	Activity level for sector E2
M1	Activity level for sector M1
M2	Activity level for sector M2
W	Activity level for sector W
P1	Price index for commodity X
P2	Price index for commodity Y
PL	Price index for primary factor L
PK	Price index for primary factor K
PW	Price index for welfare (consumer price index)
PFX	Real exchange rate index
CONS	Income definition for CONS;

EQUATIONS

PRF_X1 Zero profit for sector X1
 PRF_X2 Zero profit for sector X2
 PRF_E1 Zero profit for sector E1
 PRF_E2 Zero profit for sector E2
 PRF_M1 Zero profit for sector M1
 PRF_M2 Zero profit for sector M2
 PRF_W Zero profit for sector W

MKT_X1 Supply-demand balance for commodity X1
 MKT_X2 Supply-demand balance for commodity X2
 MKT_PFX Supply-demand balance for commodity PFX
 MKT_L Supply-demand balance for primary factor L
 MKT_K Supply-demand balance for primary factor L
 MKT_W Supply-demand balance for aggregate demand

I_CONS Income definition for CONS;

* *Zero profit conditions*

PRF_X1.. $150 * PL^{0.9} * PK^{0.1} = G = 150 * P1;$

PRF_X2.. $50 * PL^{0.1} * PK^{0.9} = G = 50 * P2;$

PRF_E1.. $50 * P1 = G = 50 * PFX * PE1;$

$$\text{PRF_E2..} \quad 50 * P2 =G= 50 * PFX * PE2;$$

$$\text{PRF_M1..} \quad 50 * PFX * PM1 * TC * TR =G= 50 * P1;$$

$$\text{PRF_M2..} \quad 50 * PFX * PM2 * TC * TR =G= 50 * P2;$$

$$\text{PRF_W..} \quad 100 * P1^{**0.5} * P2^{**0.5} =G= 100 * PW;$$

* *Market clearance conditions*

$$\text{MKT_X1..} \quad 150 * X1 + 50 * M1 / TC =G= 50 * E1 + 100 * W * PW / P1;$$

$$\text{MKT_X2..} \quad 50 * X2 + 50 * M2 / TC =G= 50 * E2 + 100 * W * PW / P2 ;$$

$$\text{MKT_PFX..} \quad 50 * E2 * PE2 + 50 * E1 * PE1 =G= 50 * PM2 * M2 + 50 * PM1 * M1;$$

$$\text{MKT_W..} \quad 200 * W =G= \text{CONS} / PW;$$

$$\text{MKT_L..} \quad 140 =G= 135 * X1 * P1 / PL + 5 * X2 * P2 / PL;$$

$$\text{MKT_K..} \quad 60 =G= 15 * X1 * P1 / PK + 45 * X2 * P2 / PK;$$

* *Income balance*

$$\text{I_CONS..} \quad \text{CONS} =E= 140 * PL + 60 * PK + 50 * PFX * PM2 * (TR - 1) * M2;$$

```
MODEL SOE /PRF_X1.X1, PRF_X2.X2, PRF_E1.E1, PRF_E2.E2,  
          PRF_M1.M1, PRF_M2.M2, PRF_W.W,  
          MKT_X1.P1, MKT_X2.P2, MKT_PFX.PFX, MKT_L.PL,  
          MKT_K.PK, MKT_W.PW, I_CONS.CONST /;
```

```
*      set benchmark values:
```

```
X1.L      =1;  
X2.L      =1;  
E2.L      =0;  
M1.L      =0;  
E1.L      =1;  
M2.L      =1;  
W.L       =1;  
  
P1.L      =1;  
P2.L      =1;  
PFX.L     =1;  
PK.L      =1;  
PL.L      =1;  
CONS.L    =200;
```

```
* choose the real consumer price index as numeraire
```

```
PW.FX     =1;
```

** check for calibration and starting-value errors*

```
SOE.ITERLIM = 0;  
SOLVE SOE USING MCP;
```

```
SOE.ITERLIM = 2000;  
SOLVE SOE USING MCP;
```

** SHOW HOW TO DO MULTIPLE SCENARIOS*

** SHOW DIFFERENCE BETWEEN TARIFF AND TRADE COST OF EQUAL RATES*

```
SETS I indexes 25 different gross cost levels /I1*I25/  
      J indexes 2 scenarios: 1 = tariff 2 = trade cost /J1*J2/;
```

PARAMETERS

```
RATE(I)  
WELFARE(I,J)  
IMP2(I,J)  
TRATE(I,J)  
TCOST(I,J)  
RESULTS(I, *);
```

```
LOOP(J,  
LOOP(I,
```

```
TC = 1; TR = 1;
RATE(I) = 1 + .05*ORD(I) - 0.05;
TR$(ORD(J) EQ 1) = RATE(I);
TC$(ORD(J) EQ 2) = RATE(I);
```

```
SOLVE SOE USING MCP;
```

```
WELFARE(I,J) = W.L;
IMP2(I,J) = M2.L/TC;
```

```
);
```

```
);
```

```
RESULTS(I, "RATE") = RATE(I);
RESULTS(I, "WELTR") = WELFARE(I, "J1");
RESULTS(I, "WELTC") = WELFARE(I, "J2");
RESULTS(I, "IMP2TR") = IMP2(I, "J1");
RESULTS(I, "IMP2TC") = IMP2(I, "J2");
```

```
DISPLAY RESULTS;
```

```
* Write parameter RESULTS to an Excel file M8.XLS,
* starting in Sheet1
```

Execute_Unload 'M8.gdx' RESULTS

execute 'gdxxrw.exe M8.gdx par=RESULTS rng=SHEET1!'

** simpler but less sophisticated dump to excel*

\$LIBINCLUDE XLDUMP RESULTS M8.XLS SHEET2!

8.3 Small open economy: calibrating to tariffs in the benchmark

This model has a 20% tariff in the benchmark data. It is important to keep track of prices and trade balance in this situation.

Markets	Production Sectors				Consumer	
	X1	X2	E1	M2	W	CONS
P1	150		-50		-100	
P2		40		60	-100	
PL	-100	-20				120
PK	-50	-20				70
PW					200	-200
PFX			50	-50		
Tariff				-10		10

Trade balance holds, since exports of good 1 generate 50 units of foreign exchange and those 50 units are spent on imports.

Consumers spend 60 on imports of which 10 is the tariff, or 20% of the value of imports (10/50).

The convention we adopt here is that all domestic prices are equal to 1 initially. Since the export good X_1 is freely traded, then the international price of X_1 is also equal to 1.

However, the import good has a domestic price equal to $(1 + TM_2)$ times the world price, so if the domestic price is equal to 1 then the world price must equal $1 / (1 + TM_2) = 1/1.2$.

Thus the -50 in the column M_2 of the matrix is interpreted as 60 units at a price of $1/1.2$.

The counterfactual experiment is free trade.

\$TITLE: M8-3: Small open economy with a benchmark tariff

\$ONTEXT

In this example, units are chosen such that all DOMESTIC prices equal one initially. Implied world price of import good

X2: $P2 = 1/1.2$

	<i>Production Sectors</i>					<i>Consumer</i>	
<i>Markets</i>	/	<i>X1</i>	<i>X2</i>	<i>E1</i>	<i>M2</i>	<i>W</i>	<i>CONS</i>
<i>P1</i>	/	150		-50		-100	
<i>P2</i>	/		40		60	-100	
<i>PL</i>	/	-100	-20				120
<i>PK</i>	/	-50	-20				70
<i>PW</i>	/					200	-200
<i>PFX</i>	/			50	-50		
<i>TARIFF</i>	/				-10		10

\$OFFTEXT

PARAMETERS

PE2 Export price of good 2
 PM1 Import price of good 1
 PE1 Export price of good 1
 PM2 Import price of good 2


```
TM2      Import tariff for good 2;

PE1      = 1;
PM2      = 1 / (1.2);
PE2      = PM2 * 0.99;
PM1      = 1.01;
TM2      = 0.2;
```

POSITIVE VARIABLES

```
X1      Activity level for sector X1
X2      Activity level for sector X2
E1      Activity level for sector E1
E2      Activity level for sector E2
M1      Activity level for sector M1
M2      Activity level for sector M2
W       Activity level for sector W (Hicksian welfare index)
P1      Price index for commodity X
P2      Price index for commodity Y
PL      Price index for primary factor L
PK      Price index for primary factor K
PW      Price index for welfare (expenditure function)
PFX     Read exchange rate index
CONS    Income definition for CONS;
```

EQUATIONS

PRF_X1 Zero profit for sector X1
 PRF_X2 Zero profit for sector X2
 PRF_E1 Zero profit for sector E1
 PRF_E2 Zero profit for sector E2
 PRF_M1 Zero profit for sector M1
 PRF_M2 Zero profit for sector M2
 PRF_W Zero profit for sector W (Hicksian welfare index)

MKT_X1 Supply-demand balance for commodity X1
 MKT_X2 Supply-demand balance for commodity X2
 MKT_PFX Supply-demand balance for commodity PFX
 MKT_L Supply-demand balance for primary factor L
 MKT_K Supply-demand balance for primary factor L
 MKT_W Supply-demand balance for aggregate demand

I_CONS Income definition for CONS;

* *Zero profit conditions*

PRF_X1.. 150 * PL**(2/3) * PK**(1/3) =G= 150 * P1;

PRF_X2.. 40 * PL**(0.5) * PK**(0.5) =G= 40 * P2;

PRF_E1.. 50 * P1 =G= 50 * PFX * PE1;

$$\text{PRF_E2..} \quad 60 * P2 =G= 60 * \text{PFX} * \text{PE2};$$

$$\text{PRF_M1..} \quad 50 * \text{PFX} * \text{PM1} =G= 50 * P1;$$

$$\text{PRF_M2..} \quad 60 * \text{PFX} * \text{PM2} * (1+\text{TM2}) =G= 60 * P2;$$

$$\text{PRF_W..} \quad 200 * P1^{**0.5} * P2^{**0.5} =G= 200 * \text{PW};$$

* *Market clearance conditions*

$$\text{MKT_X1..} \quad 150 * X1 + 50 * M1 =G= 50 * E1 + 100 * W * \text{PW}/P1;$$

$$\text{MKT_X2..} \quad 40 * X2 + 60 * M2 =G= 60 * E2 + 100 * W * \text{PW}/P2 ;$$

$$\text{MKT_PFX..} \quad 60 * E2 * \text{PE2} + 50 * E1 * \text{PE1} =G= \\ 60 * M2 * \text{PM2} + 50 * \text{PM1} * M1;$$

$$\text{MKT_W..} \quad 200 * W =G= \text{CONS} / \text{PW};$$

$$\text{MKT_L..} \quad 120 =G= 100 * X1 * P1/\text{PL} + 20 * X2 * P2/\text{PL};$$

$$\text{MKT_K..} \quad 70 =G= 50 * X1 * P1/\text{PK} + 20 * X2 * P2/\text{PK};$$

* *Income balance*

$$\text{I_CONS..} \quad \text{CONS} =E= 120 * \text{PL} + 70 * \text{PK} + 60 * \text{PFX} * \text{PM2} * M2 * \text{TM2};$$

```
MODEL SOETARIFF /PRF_X1.X1, PRF_X2.X2, PRF_E1.E1, PRF_E2.E2,  
                PRF_M1.M1, PRF_M2.M2, PRF_W.W,  
                MKT_X1.P1, MKT_X2.P2, MKT_PFX.PFX, MKT_L.PL,  
                MKT_K.PK, MKT_W.PW, I_CONS.CONS /;
```

* *Check the benchmark (again):*

```
X1.L =1;  
X2.L =1;  
E2.L =0;  
M1.L =0;  
E1.L =1;  
M2.L =1;  
W.L =1;
```

```
P1.L =1;  
P2.L =1;  
PFX.L =1;  
PK.L =1;  
PW.FX =1;  
PL.L =1;
```

```
CONS.L =200;
```

```
SOETARIFF.ITERLIM = 0;
```

SOLVE SOETARIFF USING MCP ;

SOETARIFF.ITERLIM = 2000 ;

SOLVE SOETARIFF USING MCP ;

** ccounterfactual experiment: free trade*

TM2 = 0 ;

SOLVE SOETARIFF USING MCP ;

8.4a Small open economy: modeling a quota as an endogenous tax equivalent

This model assumes the same benchmark data as the previous two models, but it assumes that there is a quota limiting imports.

The quota generates a gap between the foreign or world supply price and the domestic demand price for the “rationed” good.

This difference, often referred to as a quota rent (it is a form of Ricardian rent), must go to some agent.

In this model, we model this as a “tariff equivalent”.

The size of the tariff equivalent is endogenous, set so that the level of imports is less than or equal to the quota level.

We use an auxiliary variable, PQ, for an endogenous tax rate and a constraint equation to set the value of this “tax”.

The revenue from this tax is assigned to the representative consumer in the block for the import demand for M2.

The constraint equation (A_PQ) says to set the value of the tax PQ such that the activity level for imports (calibrated to be 1 initially) is less than or equal to 1.

$$A_PQ.. \quad 1 = G = M2;$$

And “tax” revenue (quota rent) is returned to the consumer.

$$\begin{aligned} \text{CONS} = E = & 120 * \text{ENDOW} * \text{PL} + 70 * \text{ENDOW} * \text{PK} \\ & + 60 * \text{PFX} * \text{PM2} * \text{M2} * \text{PQ}; \end{aligned}$$

Units are chosen such that all domestic prices equal 1. The counterfactual experiment is to set remove the quota.

This is done with the statement $PQ.FX = 0$; since PQ is a variable, not a parameter.

An alternative way to do this is to declare a parameter and use it in place of the '1' on the left-hand side of the constraint equation. Then the quota can be set at any level.

The value of PQ can be thought of as the tariff equivalent of the quota or the "shadow tariff". To reintroduce the quota, we must free up PQ with two statements:

$$PQ.L = 0;$$

$$PQ.UP = +INF;$$

The second counterfactual is to triple the size of the economy.

\$TITLE M8-4a.GMS: Small open economy with a benchmark quota
 * modeled as an endogenous tax rate

\$ONTEXT

In this example, units are chosen such that all DOMESTIC prices equal one initially. Implied world price of import good X2: $P2 = 1/1.2$

	Production Sectors				Consumer		
Markets	/	X1	X2	E1	M2	W	CONS
P1	/	150		-50		-100	
P2	/		40		60	-100	
PL	/	-100	-20				120
PK	/	-50	-20				70
PW	/					200	-200
PFX	/			50	-50		
Q (quota rent)	/				-10		10

\$OFFTEXT

PARAMETERS

PE2 Export price of good 2
 PM1 Import price of good 1
 PE1 Export price of good 1

PM2 Import price of good 2
ENDOW Endowment multiplier (size of the economy);

PE1 = 1;
PM2 = 1 / (1.2);
PE2 = PM2 * 0.99;
PM1 = 1.01;
ENDOW = 1;

NONNEGATIVE VARIABLES

X1 Activity level for sector X1,
X2 Activity level for sector X2,
E1 Activity level for sector E1,
E2 Activity level for sector E2,
M1 Activity level for sector M1,
M2 Activity level for sector M2,
W Activity level for sector W,
P1 Price index for commodity X,
P2 Price index for commodity Y,
PL Price index for primary factor L,
PK Price index for primary factor K,
PW Price index for welfare (expenditure function),
PFX Read exchange rate index,
CONS Income definition for CONS
PQ Quota shadow price (ad valorem tariff equivalent);

EQUATIONS

PRF_X1 Zero profit for sector X1

PRF_X2 Zero profit for sector X2

PRF_E1 Zero profit for sector E1

PRF_E2 Zero profit for sector E2

PRF_M1 Zero profit for sector M1

PRF_M2 Zero profit for sector M2

PRF_W Zero profit for sector W

MKT_X1 Supply-demand balance for commodity X1

MKT_X2 Supply-demand balance for commodity X2

MKT_PFX Supply-demand balance for commodity PFX

MKT_L Supply-demand balance for primary factor L

MKT_K Supply-demand balance for primary factor L

MKT_W Supply-demand balance for aggregate demand

I_CONS Income definition for CONS

A_PQ Quota auxiliary (sets endogenous shadow tax PQ);

* *Zero profit conditions*

PRF_X1.. 150 * PL**(2/3) * PK**(1/3) =G= 150*P1;

PRF_X2.. 40 * PL**(0.5) * PK**(0.5) =G= 40*P2;

PRF_E1.. 50 * P1 =G= 50 * PFX * PE1;

$$\text{PRF_E2.. } 60 * P2 =G= 60 * \text{PFX} * \text{PE2};$$

$$\text{PRF_M1.. } 50 * \text{PFX} * \text{PM1} =G= 50 * P1;$$

$$\text{PRF_M2.. } 60 * \text{PFX} * \text{PM2} * (1+\text{PQ}) =G= 60 * P2;$$

$$\text{PRF_W.. } 200 * P1^{**0.5} * P2^{**0.5} =G= 200 * \text{PW};$$

* *Market clearance conditions*

$$\text{MKT_X1.. } 150 * X1 + 50 * M1 =G= 50 * E1 + 100 * W * \text{PW} / P1;$$

$$\text{MKT_X2.. } 40 * X2 + 60 * M2 =G= 60 * E2 + 100 * W * \text{PW} / P2 ;$$

$$\text{MKT_PFX.. } 60 * E2 * \text{PE2} + 50 * E1 * \text{PE1} =G= 60 * M2 * \text{PM2} + 50 * \text{PM1} * M1;$$

$$\text{MKT_W.. } 200 * W =G= \text{CONS} / \text{PW};$$

$$\text{MKT_L.. } 120 * \text{ENDOW} =G= 100 * X1 * P1 / \text{PL} + 20 * X2 * P2 / \text{PL};$$

$$\text{MKT_K.. } 70 * \text{ENDOW} =G= 50 * X1 * P1 / \text{PK} + 20 * X2 * P2 / \text{PK};$$

* *Income balance*

$$\text{I_CONS.. } \text{CONS} =E= 120 * \text{ENDOW} * \text{PL} + 70 * \text{ENDOW} * \text{PK} + 60 * \text{PFX} * \text{PM2} * M2 * \text{PQ};$$

```
A_PQ..      1 =G= M2;
```

```
MODEL SOE2 /PRF_X1.X1, PRF_X2.X2, PRF_E1.E1, PRF_E2.E2,  
            PRF_M1.M1, PRF_M2.M2,  
            PRF_W.W, MKT_X1.P1, MKT_X2.P2, MKT_PFX.PFX,  
            MKT_L.PL, MKT_K.PK, MKT_W.PW,  
            I_CONS.CONS, A_PQ.PQ /;
```

```
*      Check the benchmark (again):
```

```
X1.L      =1;  
X2.L      =1;  
E2.L      =0;  
M1.L      =0;  
E1.L      =1;  
M2.L      =1;  
W.L       =1;
```

```
P1.L      =1;  
P2.L      =1;  
PFX.L     =1;  
PK.L      =1;  
PW.FX     =1;  
PL.L      =1;
```

CONS.L = 200;

PQ.L = 0.20;

SOE2.ITERLIM = 0;

SOLVE SOE2 USING MCP;

SOE2.ITERLIM = 2000;

SOLVE SOE2 USING MCP;

** counterfactual: fixed PQ = 0 to calculate free trade*

PQ.FX = 0;

SOLVE SOE2 USING MCP;

** show that the quota becomes more restrictive*

** as the economy grows*

PQ.LO = 0;

PQ.UP = +**INF**;

ENDOW = 3;

SOLVE SOE2 USING MCP;

** show what would happen if there had been a fixed 0.20 tariff*

** instead of the quota*

```
PQ.FX = 0.20;  
SOLVE SOE2 USING MCP;
```

```
PQ.LO = 0;  
PQ.UP = +INF;
```

** show what would happen if the economy were smaller than the benchmark*

```
ENDOW = 0.25;  
SOLVE SOE2 USING MCP;
```

8.4b Small open economy: modeling a quota as a supply/demand for licenses

This is the same exercise as the previous M8.4a, except it shows an alternative way of modeling a quota or indeed any quantitative restriction.

This is to assume that the quota is enforced by licences sold to importers.

The government might auction them off, for example (which does happen in practice for certain licenses and permits).

We will assume that the government returns the receipt lump sum to the representative consumer.

Now, instead of an auxiliary variable and constraint equation, we have an added variable PLIC, the price of a license,

and a market clearing equation MKT_LIC which equates the exogenous supply of licences (SLIC) to the demand for them.

PARAMETER

SLIC Supply of import licenses for X2;

NON-NEGATIVE VARIABLE

PLIC Price of a license;

EQUATION

MKT_LIC Market for import licenses;

PRF_M2.. $60 \cdot \text{PLIC} + 60 \cdot \text{PFX} \cdot \text{PM2} = \text{G} = 60 \cdot \text{P2};$

MKT_LIC.. $60 \cdot \text{SLIC} = \text{G} = 60 \cdot \text{M2};$

I_CONS.. $\text{CONS} = \text{E} = 120 \cdot \text{ENDOW} \cdot \text{PL} + 70 \cdot \text{ENDOW} \cdot \text{PK} + 60 \cdot \text{PLIC} \cdot \text{SLIC};$

\$TITLE M8-4b: Small open economy with a benchmark quota
 * *modeled as supply/demand for import licenses*

\$ONTEXT

In this example, units are chosen such that all DOMESTIC prices equal one initially.

Implied world price of import good X2 $P2 = 1/1.2$

	<i>Production Sectors</i>				<i>Consumer</i>		
<i>Markets</i>	/	<i>X1</i>	<i>X2</i>	<i>E1</i>	<i>M2</i>	<i>W</i>	<i>CONS</i>
<i>P1</i>	/	150		-50		-100	
<i>P2</i>	/		40		60	-100	
<i>PL</i>	/	-100	-20				120
<i>PK</i>	/	-50	-20				70
<i>PW</i>	/					200	-200
<i>PFX</i>	/			50	-50		
<i>PLIC</i>	/				-10		10

\$OFFTEXT

PARAMETERS

PE2 Export price of good 2

PM1 Import price of good 1
 PE1 Export price of good 1
 PM2 Import price of good 2
 SLIC Supply of import licenses for X2 (M2)
 ENDOW Endowment multiplier (size of the economy);

PE1 = 1;
 PM2 = 1 / (1.2);
 PE2 = PM2 * 0.99;
 PM1 = 1.01;
 SLIC = 1;
 ENDOW = 1;

NONNEGATIVE VARIABLES

X1 Activity level for sector X1,
 X2 Activity level for sector X2,
 E1 Activity level for sector E1,
 E2 Activity level for sector E2,
 M1 Activity level for sector M1,
 M2 Activity level for sector M2,
 W Activity level for sector W,
 P1 Price index for commodity X,
 P2 Price index for commodity Y,
 PL Price index for primary factor L,
 PK Price index for primary factor K,
 PW Price index for welfare (expenditure function),

PFX Read exchange rate index,
 CONS Income definition for CONS
 PLIC Price of a license (ad valorem tariff equivalent);

EQUATIONS

PRF_X1 Zero profit for sector X1
 PRF_X2 Zero profit for sector X2
 PRF_E1 Zero profit for sector E1
 PRF_E2 Zero profit for sector E2
 PRF_M1 Zero profit for sector M1
 PRF_M2 Zero profit for sector M2
 PRF_W Zero profit for sector W

MKT_X1 Supply-demand balance for commodity X1
 MKT_X2 Supply-demand balance for commodity X2
 MKT_PFX Supply-demand balance for commodity PFX
 MKT_L Supply-demand balance for primary factor L
 MKT_K Supply-demand balance for primary factor L
 MKT_W Supply-demand balance for aggregate demand

I_CONS Income definition for CONS
 MKT_LIC Market for import licenses;

* *Zero profit conditions*

PRF_X1.. $150 * PL^{**}(2/3) * PK^{**}(1/3) =G= 150 * P1;$

$$\text{PRF_X2..} \quad 40 * \text{PL}^{**}(0.5) * \text{PK}^{**}(0.5) =G= 40 * \text{P2};$$

$$\text{PRF_E1..} \quad 50 * \text{P1} =G= 50 * \text{PFX} * \text{PE1};$$

$$\text{PRF_E2..} \quad 60 * \text{P2} =G= 60 * \text{PFX} * \text{PE2};$$

$$\text{PRF_M1..} \quad 50 * \text{PFX} * \text{PM1} =G= 50 * \text{P1};$$

$$\text{PRF_M2..} \quad 60 * \text{PLIC} + 60 * \text{PFX} * \text{PM2} =G= 60 * \text{P2};$$

$$\text{PRF_W..} \quad 200 * \text{P1}^{**}0.5 * \text{P2}^{**}0.5 =G= 200 * \text{PW};$$

* *Market clearance conditions*

$$\text{MKT_X1..} \quad 150 * \text{X1} + 50 * \text{M1} =G= 50 * \text{E1} + 100 * \text{W} * \text{PW} / \text{P1};$$

$$\text{MKT_X2..} \quad 40 * \text{X2} + 60 * \text{M2} =G= 60 * \text{E2} + 100 * \text{W} * \text{PW} / \text{P2} ;$$

$$\text{MKT_PFX..} \quad 60 * \text{E2} * \text{PE2} + 50 * \text{E1} * \text{PE1} =G= 60 * \text{M2} * \text{PM2} + 50 * \text{PM1} * \text{M1};$$

$$\text{MKT_W..} \quad 200 * \text{W} =G= \text{CONS} / \text{PW};$$

$$\text{MKT_L..} \quad 120 * \text{ENDOW} =G= 100 * \text{X1} * \text{P1} / \text{PL} + 20 * \text{X2} * \text{P2} / \text{PL};$$

$$\text{MKT_K..} \quad 70 * \text{ENDOW} =G= 50 * \text{X1} * \text{P1} / \text{PK} + 20 * \text{X2} * \text{P2} / \text{PK};$$

```
MKT_LIC..    60*SLIC =G= 60*M2;
```

```
*           Income balance
```

```
I_CONS..    CONS =E= 120*ENDOW*PL + 70*ENDOW*PK + 60*PLIC*SLIC;
```

```
MODEL ALGEBRAIC /PRF_X1.X1, PRF_X2.X2, PRF_E1.E1, PRF_E2.E2,  
                PRF_M1.M1, PRF_M2.M2,  
                PRF_W.W, MKT_X1.P1, MKT_X2.P2, MKT_PFX.PFX,  
                MKT_L.PL, MKT_K.PK, MKT_W.PW,  
                MKT_LIC.PLIC, I_CONS.CONS/;
```

```
*           Check the benchmark:
```

```
X1.L        =1;
```

```
X2.L        =1;
```

```
E2.L        =0;
```

```
M1.L        =0;
```

```
E1.L        =1;
```

```
M2.L        =1;
```

```
W.L         =1;
```

```
P1.L        =1;
```

```
P2.L        =1;
```

```
PFX.L = 1;  
PK.L = 1;  
PW.FX = 1;  
PL.L = 1;
```

```
CONS.L = 200;
```

```
PLIC.L = 1/6;
```

```
ALGEBRAIC.ITERLIM = 0;  
SOLVE ALGEBRAIC USING MCP;
```

```
ALGEBRAIC.ITERLIM = 2000;  
SOLVE ALGEBRAIC USING MCP;
```

** show what happens if the supply of licenses is greatly expanded*

```
SLIC = 5;  
SOLVE ALGEBRAIC USING MCP;
```

** show that the quota becomes more restrictive as
* the economy grows*

```
SLIC = 1;  
ENDOW = 3;  
SOLVE ALGEBRAIC USING MCP;
```

8.5 Large economy and the optimal tariff

For many countries, or for a small number of commodities for one country, the small-country assumption of fixed world prices may not be appropriate.

One alternative is to model the whole world.

But it may be convenient and appropriate for the modeler to stick with the country and question and continue to represent the rest of the world with trade transformation functions.

We show how to do this, allowing for prices to change with quantities supplied and demanded.

We declare an auxiliary variable, TOT for terms of trade, the relative price of the country's export good (good 1).

Then there is a constraint equation T_TOT, which specifies that the TOT falls as the country exports more of good 1.

$$T_TOT = G = E1^{**}(-0.3)$$

The TOT will also appear two other places in the model: in the pricing equation for exports (the higher the TOT, the more foreign exchange (FX) is earned from a unit of good one exported (E1)

$$PRF_E1.. 50 * P1 = G = 50 * PFX * TOT;$$

TOT also appears in the equation for trade balance which determines the price of foreign exchange.

$$MKT_PFX.. 50 * 0.99 * E2 + (50 * TOT) * E1 = G = 50 * M2 + 50 * 1.01 * M1;$$

Assumed there are many consumers/producers inside the country: each views themselves as a price taker even though the country as a whole has influence over world prices.

	Production Sectors					Consumer
Markets	X1	X2	E1	M2	W	CONS
P1	150		-50		-100	
P2		50		50	-100	
PL	-100	-20				120
PK	-50	-30				80
PW					200	-200
PFX			50	-50		

We have specified this as a Cobb-Douglas function, so we are assuming that it is of the form:

$$TOT = E_1^{-0.3} \quad \frac{E_1}{TOT} \frac{\partial TOT}{\partial E_1} = -0.3$$

The elasticity of the relative export price with respect to export quantity is -0.3. Think of export earnings as: $TOT * E1 = E_1^{0.7}$

Then if you do the algebra, the elasticity of export earnings with respect to export quantity is 0.7. This is a strong term-of-trade effect, and will lead to the usual optimal tariff argument for protection.

Counterfactual is to impose a 0.20 tariff, which improves welfare.

Optimal tariff solved as an MPEC

First, add one variable (which is just welfare) and one equation.

VARIABLES

```
WELOPT;
```

EQUATIONS

```
WELFOPT;
```

```
WELFOPT.. WELOPT =E= W;
```

ADD the objective function to the model and DELETE the dummy equation TARIFF.

The tariff TM2 now does not appear as a matched variable but will be solved for in the optimization.

\$TITLE: M8-5.GMS: Large open economy model

* modeled as an MCP and then as an MPEC to solve for the optimal tariff

\$ONTEXT

This is similar to model M8-1.gms, but the terms of trade now depend on the level of exports: high exports, lower prices here this is modeled with an auxiliary variable TOT where TOT is the relative price of exports to imports TOT is set by the constraint equation T_TOT: $TOT = E1^{*(-0.3)}$

	Production Sectors					Consumer	
Markets	X1	X2	E1	M2	W	CONSH	
P1	150		-50		-100		
P2		50		50	-100		
PL	-100	-10				110	
PK	-50	-40				90	
PW					200	-200	
PFX			50	-50			

\$OFFTEXT

PARAMETERS

- FIXT Fixed values of the tariff
- OPTIMALT Optimal tariff in the MPEC;

FIXT = 0;

NONNEGATIVE VARIABLES

X1 Activity level for sector X1,
X2 Activity level for sector X2,
E1 Activity level for sector E1,
E2 Activity level for sector E2,
M1 Activity level for sector M1,
M2 Activity level for sector M2,
W Activity level for sector W,
P1 Price index for commodity X,
P2 Price index for commodity Y,
PL Price index for primary factor L,
PK Price index for primary factor K,
PW Price index for welfare (expenditure function),
PFX Read exchange rate index,

CONSH Income definition for home agent
TOT Terms of trade: world price of export good 1
TM2 Tariff - initially held fixed;

EQUATIONS

PRF_X1 Zero profit for sector X1
PRF_X2 Zero profit for sector X2
PRF_E1 Zero profit for sector E1

PRF_E2 Zero profit for sector E2
 PRF_M1 Zero profit for sector M1
 PRF_M2 Zero profit for sector M2
 PRF_W Zero profit for sector W

MKT_X1 Supply-demand balance for commodity X1
 MKT_X2 Supply-demand balance for commodity X2
 MKT_PFX Supply-demand balance for commodity PFX
 MKT_L Supply-demand balance for primary factor L
 MKT_K Supply-demand balance for primary factor L
 MKT_W Supply-demand balance for aggregate demand

I_CONSH Income definition for CONSH
 T_TOT Equation for TOT
 TARIFF Dummy equation to fix the tariff as if a parameter;

* *Zero profit conditions*

PRF_X1.. $150 * PL^{(2/3)} * PK^{(1/3)} =G= 150 * P1;$

PRF_X2.. $50 * PL^{(1/4)} * PK^{(3/4)} =G= 50 * P2;$

PRF_E1.. $50 * P1 =G= 50 * PFX * TOT;$

PRF_E2.. $50 * P2 =G= 50 * 0.99 * PFX;$

$$\text{PRF_M1..} \quad 50 * \text{PFX} * \text{TOT} * 1.01 = \text{G} = 50 * \text{P1};$$

$$\text{PRF_M2..} \quad 50 * \text{PFX} * (1 + \text{TM2}) = \text{G} = 50 * \text{P2};$$

$$\text{PRF_W..} \quad 200 * \text{P1} ** 0.5 * \text{P2} ** 0.5 = \text{G} = 200 * \text{PW};$$

* *Market clearance conditions*

$$\text{MKT_X1..} \quad 150 * \text{X1} + 50 * \text{M1} = \text{G} = 50 * \text{E1} + 100 * \text{W} * \text{PW} / \text{P1};$$

$$\text{MKT_X2..} \quad 50 * \text{X2} + 50 * \text{M2} = \text{G} = 50 * \text{E2} + 100 * \text{W} * \text{PW} / \text{P2};$$

$$\text{MKT_PFX..} \quad 50 * 0.99 * \text{E2} + (50 * \text{TOT}) * \text{E1} = \text{G} = 50 * \text{M2} + 50 * 1.01 * \text{M1};$$

$$\text{MKT_W..} \quad 200 * \text{W} = \text{G} = \text{CONSH} / \text{PW};$$

$$\text{MKT_L..} \quad 110 = \text{G} = 100 * \text{X1} * \text{P1} / \text{PL} + 10 * \text{X2} * \text{P2} / \text{PL};$$

$$\text{MKT_K..} \quad 90 = \text{G} = 50 * \text{X1} * \text{P1} / \text{PK} + 40 * \text{X2} * \text{P2} / \text{PK};$$

* *Income balance, auxiliary equation*

$$\text{I_CONSH..} \quad \text{CONSH} = \text{E} = 110 * \text{PL} + 90 * \text{PK} + 50 * \text{M2} * \text{PFX} * \text{TM2};$$

$$\text{T_TOT..} \quad \text{TOT} = \text{G} = \text{E1} ** (-0.3);$$


```
TARIFF..    TM2 =E= FIXT;
```

```
MODEL LOE /PRF_X1.X1, PRF_X2.X2, PRF_E1.E1, PRF_E2.E2,  
           PRF_W.W, PRF_M1.M1, PRF_M2.M2,  
           MKT_X1.P1, MKT_X2.P2, MKT_PFX.PFX, MKT_L.PL,  
           MKT_K.PK, MKT_W.PW,  
           I_CONSH.CONSH, T_TOT.TOT, TARIFF.TM2 /;
```

```
*          Check the benchmark:
```

```
X1.L      =1;  
X2.L      =1;  
E2.L      =0;  
E1.L      =1;  
M2.L      =1;  
M1.L      =0;  
W.L       =1;  
P1.L      =1;  
P2.L      =1;  
PFX.L     =1;  
PK.L      =1;  
PW.FX     =1;  
PL.L      =1;  
CONSH.L   =200;  
TOT.L     = 1;  
TM2.L     = 0;
```

LOE.ITERLIM = 0;

SOLVE LOE USING MCP;

LOE.ITERLIM = 10000;

SOLVE LOE USING MCP;

* *Apply a tariff which improves the terms of trade and home*
* *welfare:*

FIXT = 0.2;

SOLVE LOE USING MCP;

* *now let's reformulate the problem as an MPEC to solve for the*
* *optimal tariff*

VARIABLES

WELOPT;

EQUATIONS

WELFOPT;

WELFOPT.. WELOPT =E= W;

** ADD the objective function and DELETE the dummy equation TARIFF*

```
MODEL OPTTARIFF /WELFOPT, PRF_X1.X1, PRF_X2.X2, PRF_E1.E1, PRF_E2.E2,  
                PRF_W.W, PRF_M1.M1, PRF_M2.M2,  
                MKT_X1.P1, MKT_X2.P2, MKT_PFX.PFX, MKT_L.PL,  
                MKT_K.PK, MKT_W.PW,  
                I_CONSH.CONSH, T_TOT.TOT/;
```

```
OPTION MPEC = nlpec;
```

```
SOLVE OPTTARIFF USING MPEC MAXIMIZING WELOPT;
```

```
OPTIMALT = TM2.L;
```

```
DISPLAY OPTIMALT;
```

** go back to the original MCP and "brute force" search for the optimal
* tariff and see if it matches the MPEC value*

```
SETS I /I1*I51/;
```

PARAMETERS

```
IMTARIFF(I)
```

```
WELFARE(I);
```

LOOP (I ,

FIXT = 0.005***ORD**(I)**2 - 0.005;

SOLVE LOE USING MCP;

IMTARIFF(I) = TM2.L;

WELFARE(I) = W.L;

);

DISPLAY IMTARIFF, WELFARE;

The optimal tariff in this scenario is 0.480. How does this compare to the optimal tariff from economic theory?

Let t be the import tariff and let τ (tau) be an export tax with the world price as the base, world price denote with stars

$$p_1 = p_1^* (1 - \tau)$$

Economic theory show that the optimal value of τ should be given by an inverse elasticity rule:

τ should equal the inverse of the foreign elasticity of demand (defined as positive) for our export good.

Let this be given by η . Then $\tau = 1/\eta$. Note that this is just saying that marginal cost of exports (domestic price) should equal marginal revenue.

$$mc = p_1 = p_1^* (1 - 1/\eta) = \text{marginal revenue on export sales}$$

In our formulation above, 0.3 is the inverse elasticity, and hence the optimum export tax is $\tau = 0.3$.

Does this hold in our numerical example? The relationship between an import tariff and export tax as defined above can be solved from

$$\frac{p_1}{p_2} = \frac{p_1^*}{p_2^* (1 + t)} \quad \frac{p_1}{p_2} = \frac{p_1 (1 - \tau)}{p_2^*} \quad 1 - \tau = \frac{1}{1 + t} \quad \tau = \frac{t}{1 + t}$$

In our example, $t = 0.480$ and so $\tau = 0.324$. This is close to but not equal to 0.30 so I am not quite sure what is going on.

Model M8-5b reformulates the problem with an export tax and arrives at the same result: the optimal export tax is 0.324.

8.6a Two-country Heckscher-Ohlin model: Nash tariffs as an iterative MPEC

This is the classic Heckscher-Ohlin model of trade: two goods, two factors of production, and two countries.

	XHH	YHH	XHF'	YHF'	XFF'	YFF'	XFH	YFH	WH	WF'	CONSH	CONSF'
PXH	150		-50						-100			
PYH		50						50	-100			
PXF'			50		50					-100		
PYF'						150		-50		-100		
PWH									200		-200	
PWF'										200		-200
PLH	-120	-10									130	
PKH	-30	-40									70	
PLF'					-40	-30						70
PKF'					-10	-120						130

Countries are symmetric, mirror images of each other.

\$TITLE: M8-6a.GMS: Full two-country Heckscher-Ohlin model
 * formulation as an MPEC allows solutions for joint welfare max
 * and non-cooperative Nash equilibrium in tariffs

\$ONTEXT

	XHH	YHH	XHF'	YHF'	XFF'	YFF'	XFH	YFH	WH	WF'	CONSH	CONSF'
PXH	150		-50						-100			
PYH		50					50	-100				
PXF'			50		50					-100		
PYF'						150	-50			-100		
PWH								200			-200	
PWF'									200			-200
PLH	-120	-10									130	
PKH	-30	-40									70	
PLF'					-40	-30						70
PKF'					-10	-120						130

\$OFFTEXT

PARAMETERS

SIZEH, SIZEF scales the endowments of countries h and f up and down
 WELBH, WELBF store free trade (B for benchmark) welfare level shares
 CASE denotes which case (of size differences) is displayed
 RESULTS(*, *), RESULTS2(*, *, *);

SIZEH = 1; SIZEF = 1;
WELBH = 0.5; WELBF = 0.5;

VARIABLES

JWELMAX joint welfare maximization
WELHMAX welfare of country h
WELFMAX welfare of country f
TARH tariff of country h
TARF tariff of country f;

POSITIVE VARIABLES

XHH X home prododuction - home consumption
YHH Y home prododuction - home consumption
XHF X home prododuction - foreign consumption
YHF Y home prododuction - foreign consumption
XFF X foreign prododuction - foreign consumption
YFF Y foreign prododuction - foreign consumption
XFH X foreign prododuction - home consumption
YFH Y foreign prododuction - home consumption
WH Activity level for sector WH (Hicksian domestic welfare index)
WF Activity level for sector WF (Hicksian foreign welfare index)
PXH Price index for commodity home X
PYH Price index for commodity home Y
PXF Price index for commodity foreign X
PYF Price index for commodity foreign X

PWH Price index for welfare domestic (expenditure function)
 PWF Price index for welfare foerign (expenditure function)
 PLH home price labor
 PKH home price capital
 PLF foreign price labor
 PKF foreign price capital
 CONSH Income definition for home agent
 CONSF Income definition for foreign agent;

EQUATIONS

OBJJ objective function for maximizing joint welfare
 OBJH objective function of country h (maximize WH)
 OBJF objective function of country f (maximize WF)
 PRF_XHH Zero profit for sector XHH
 PRF_YHH Zero profit for sector YHH
 PRF_XHF Zero profit for sector XHF
 PRF_YHF Zero profit for sector YHF
 PRF_XFF Zero profit for sector XFF
 PRF_YFF Zero profit for sector YFF
 PRF_XFH Zero profit for sector XFH
 PRF_YFH Zero profit for sector YFH
 PRF_WH Zero profit for sector WH (Hicksian home welfare index)
 PRF_WF Zero profit for sector WF (Hicksian foreign welfare index)

MKT_XH Supply-demand balance for commodity XH
 MKT_XF Supply-demand balance for commodity XF

MKT_YH Supply-demand balance for commodity YH
 MKT_YF Supply-demand balance for commodity YF
 MKT_LH Supply-demand balance for primary factor LH
 MKT_KH Supply-demand balance for primary factor KH
 MKT_LF Supply-demand balance for primary factor LF
 MKT_KF Supply-demand balance for primary factor KF
 MKT_WH Supply-demand balance for aggregate home demand
 MKT_WF Supply-demand balance for aggregate foreign demand

I_CONSF Income definition for CONSF
 I_CONSH Income definition for CONSH;

* *Zero profit conditions*

OBJJ.. JWELMAX =E= WH**WELBH*WF**WELBF;
 OBJH.. WELHMAX =E= WH;
 OBJF.. WELFMAX =E= WF;

 PRF_XHH.. 150 * PLH**(4/5) * PKH**(1/5) =G= 150 * PXH;
 PRF_YHH.. 50 * PLH**(1/5) * PKH**(4/5) =G= 50 * PYH;
 PRF_XFF.. 50 * PLF**(4/5) * PKF**(1/5) =G= 50 * PXF;
 PRF_YFF.. 150 * PLF**(1/5) * PKF**(4/5) =G= 150 * PYF;

$$\text{PRF_XHF} \dots 50 * (1+\text{TARF}) * \text{PXH} =G= 50 * \text{PXF};$$

$$\text{PRF_YHF} \dots 50.1 * \text{PYH} =G= 50 * \text{PYF};$$

$$\text{PRF_XFH} \dots 50.1 * \text{PXF} =G= 50 * \text{PXH};$$

$$\text{PRF_YFH} \dots 50 * (1+\text{TARH}) * \text{PYF} =G= 50 * \text{PYH};$$

$$\text{PRF_WH} \dots 200 * \text{PXH}^{**0.5} * \text{PYH}^{**0.5} =G= 200 * \text{PWH};$$

$$\text{PRF_WF} \dots 200 * \text{PXF}^{**0.5} * \text{PYF}^{**0.5} =G= 200 * \text{PWF};$$

* *Market clearance conditions*

$$\text{MKT_XH} \dots 150 * \text{XHH} + 50 * \text{XFH} =G= 50 * \text{XHF} + 100 * \text{WH} * \text{PWH} / \text{PXH};$$

$$\text{MKT_XF} \dots 50 * \text{XFF} + 50 * \text{XHF} =G= 50.01 * \text{XFH} + 100 * \text{WF} * \text{PWF} / \text{PXF};$$

$$\text{MKT_YH} \dots 50 * \text{YHH} + 50 * \text{YFH} =G= 50.01 * \text{YHF} + 100 * \text{WH} * \text{PWH} / \text{PYH};$$

$$\text{MKT_YF} \dots 150 * \text{YFF} + 50 * \text{YHF} =G= 50 * \text{YFH} + 100 * \text{WF} * \text{PWF} / \text{PYF};$$

$$\text{MKT_LH} \dots 130 * \text{SIZEH} =G= 120 * \text{XHH} * \text{PXH} / \text{PLH} + 10 * \text{YHH} * \text{PYH} / \text{PLH};$$

$$\text{MKT_KH} \dots 70 * \text{SIZEH} =G= 30 * \text{XHH} * \text{PXH} / \text{PKH} + 40 * \text{YHH} * \text{PYH} / \text{PKH};$$

MKT_LF.. 70*SIZEF =G= 40 * XFF * PXF/PLF + 30 * YFF * PYF/PLF;

MKT_KF.. 130*SIZEF =G= 120 * YFF * PYF/PKF + 10 * XFF * PXF/PKF;

MKT_WH.. 200 * WH =G= CONSH/PWH;

MKT_WF.. 200 * WF =G= CONSF/PWF;

* *Income balance states*

I_CONSH.. CONSH =E= 130*SIZEH*PLH + 70*SIZEH*PKH + 50*YFH*PYF*TARH;

I_CONSF.. CONSF =E= 70*SIZEF*PLF + 130*SIZEF*PKF + 50*XHF*PXH*TARF;

OPTION MPEC=nlpec;

MODEL HO /

OBJJ,

OBJH,

OBJF,

PRF_XHH.XHH,

PRF_YHH.YHH,

PRF_XHF.XHF,

PRF_YHF.YHF,

PRF_XFF.XFF,

PRF_YFF.YFF,

```
PRF_XFH.XFH,  
PRF_YFH.YFH,  
PRF_WH.WH,  
PRF_WF.WF,
```

```
MKT_XH.PXH,  
MKT_XF.PXF,  
MKT_YH.PYH,  
MKT_YF.PYF,  
MKT_LH.PLH,  
MKT_KH.PKH,  
MKT_LF.PLF,  
MKT_KF.PKF,  
MKT_WH.PWH,  
MKT_WF.PWF,
```

```
I_CONSF.CONSF,  
I_CONSH.CONSH  
/ ;
```

* *Check the benchmark*

```
XHH.L        =1 ;  
YHH.L        =1 ;  
XHF.L        =1 ;  
YHF.L        =0 ;
```

```
XFF.L =1;  
YFF.L =1;  
XFH.L =0;  
YFH.L =1;  
WH.L =1;  
WF.L =1;
```

```
PXH.L =1;  
PXF.L =1;  
PYH.L =1;  
PYF.L =1;  
PLH.L =1;  
PKH.L =1;  
PLF.L =1;  
PKF.L =1;  
PWH.FX =1;  
PWF.L =1;
```

** "benchmark" with countries symmetric and free trade:
* all activities, prices = 1*

```
HO.ITERLIM = 1000;  
SOLVE HO USING MPEC MAXIMIZING JWELMAX;
```

** allow for size differences (scaling endowments up and down)*


```
SIZEH = 1;
```

```
SIZEF = 1;
```

```
TARH.FX = 0;
```

```
TARF.FX = 0;
```

```
SOLVE HO USING MPEC MAXIMIZING JWELMAX;
```

```
* store free trade welfare levels, used to compute JWELMAX
```

```
WELBH = WH.L / (WH.L + WF.L);
```

```
WELBF = WF.L / (WH.L + WF.L);
```

```
DISPLAY WELBH, WELBF;
```

```
SOLVE HO USING MPEC MAXIMIZING JWELMAX;
```

```
RESULTS("SIZEH", "FREETR") = SIZEH;
```

```
RESULTS("WELJ", "FREETR") = JWELMAX.L;
```

```
RESULTS("WELH", "FREETR") = WH.L;
```

```
RESULTS("WELF", "FREETR") = WF.L;
```

```
RESULTS("TARIFFH", "FREETR") = TARH.L;
```

```
RESULTS("TARIFFF", "FREETR") = TARF.L;
```

```
* solve for the (unilateral by h) non-cooperative Nash equilibrium
```

```
TARH.LO = -INF;
```

```
TARH.UP = +INF;
```

```
SOLVE HO USING MPEC MAXIMIZING WELHMAX;
```

```
RESULTS("SIZEH", "UNIH") = SIZEH;  
RESULTS("WELJ", "UNIH") = JWELMAX.L;  
RESULTS("WELH", "UNIH") = WH.L;  
RESULTS("WELF", "UNIH") = WF.L;  
RESULTS("TARIFFH", "UNIH") = TARH.L;  
RESULTS("TARIFFF", "UNIH") = TARF.L;
```

```
* solve for the joint welfare max
```

```
TARH.LO = -INF;  
TARH.UP = +INF;  
TARF.LO = -INF;  
TARF.UP = +INF;
```

```
SOLVE HO USING MPEC MAXIMIZING JWELMAX;
```

```
RESULTS("SIZEH", "JMAX") = SIZEH;  
RESULTS("WELJ", "JMAX") = JWELMAX.L;  
RESULTS("WELH", "JMAX") = WH.L;  
RESULTS("WELF", "JMAX") = WF.L;  
RESULTS("TARIFFH", "JMAX") = TARH.L;  
RESULTS("TARIFFF", "JMAX") = TARF.L;
```

DISPLAY RESULTS;

** now let's look at a non-cooperative outcome in tariffs*
** iterative procedure:*
** max WH subject to TARF fixed*
** hold TARH at it's solution level and free up TARF*
** max WF solve model for fixed TARF*
** repeat 10 time*

SETS J size difference for the countries /J1*J9/;

SETS I iterative procedure to determine Nash tariffs /I1*I10/;

LOOP(J,

 SIZEH = 0.9 + 0.1***ORD**(J);

 SIZEF = 1.1 - 0.1***ORD**(J);

TARH.FX = 0;

TARF.FX = 0;

SOLVE HO USING MPEC MAXIMIZING JWELMAX;

** store free trade welfare levels in order to get*
** correct value of JWELMAX*

WELBH = WH.L / (WH.L + WF.L);

```
WELBF = WF.L / (WH.L + WF.L);
```

```
SOLVE HO USING MPEC MAXIMIZING JWELMAX;
```

```
RESULTS2(J, "SIZEH", "FREETR") = SIZEH;
```

```
RESULTS2(J, "WELJ", "FREETR") = JWELMAX.L;
```

```
RESULTS2(J, "WELH", "FREETR") = WH.L;
```

```
RESULTS2(J, "WELF", "FREETR") = WF.L;
```

```
RESULTS2(J, "TARIFFH", "FREETR") = TARH.L;
```

```
RESULTS2(J, "TARIFFF", "FREETR") = TARF.L;
```

```
* loop to compute non-cooperative Nash equilibrium in tariffs  
* fist solve for TARH given TARF, then TARF given the existing  
* value of TARH. Loop 10 times to get best-response Nash eq.
```

```
LOOP(I,
```

```
TARH.LO = -INF;
```

```
TARH.UP = +INF;
```

```
TARF.FX = TARF.L;
```

```
SOLVE HO USING MPEC MAXIMIZING WELHMAX;
```

```
TARF.LO = -INF;
```

```
TARF.UP = +INF;
```

```
TARH.FX = TARH.L;
```

SOLVE HO USING MPEC MAXIMIZING WELFMAX;

);

RESULTS2(J, "SIZEH", "NONCOOP") = SIZEH;

RESULTS2(J, "WELJ", "NONCOOP") = JWELMAX.L;

RESULTS2(J, "WELH", "NONCOOP") = WH.L;

RESULTS2(J, "WELF", "NONCOOP") = WF.L;

RESULTS2(J, "TARIFFH", "NONCOOP") = TARH.L;

RESULTS2(J, "TARIFFF", "NONCOOP") = TARF.L;

);

DISPLAY RESULTS, RESULTS2;

8.6b Two-country Heckscher-Ohlin model: Nash tariffs as an iterative MPEC, using set notation

This is the same model, but illustrating the use of sets in problems like this where countries, goods and factors can be entered more compactly as sets.

```
SETS I goods      /1, 2/
      J factors    /1, 2/
      C countries  /H, F/;
```

Data is read in as a table, and then values such as representative quantities and Cobb-Douglas share parameters in production and utility are calculated.

Not that no number appear in the equations of the model.

\$TITLE M8-6b.GMS: 2x2x2 of M8-6a in set notation

TABLE BENCH(*,*)

	XHH	YHH	XHF	YHF	XFF	YFF	XFH	YFH	UH	UF	CONSH	CONSF
PXH	150		-50						-100			
PYH		50						50	-100			
PXF			50		50					-100		
PYF						150	-50			-100		
PUH									200		-200	
PUF										200		-200
PLH	-120	-10									130	
PKH	-30	-40									70	
PLF					-40	-30						70
PKF					-10	-120						130;

DISPLAY BENCH;

SETS I goods /1, 2/
 J factors /1, 2/
 C countries /H, F/;

ALIAS (J, JJ), (I, II);

PARAMETERS

VS(J,C) endowment of factor j in country c

```

TC(I)           trade cost of importing good i for country c
BETA(I,J)       share of factor j in the production of good i
GAMMA(I)        share of good i in the utility function
WELW(C)         welfare weight of country c in world welfare
RESULTS(*,*)    assemble the results;

```

```

VS("1", "H") = BENCH("PLH", "CONSH");
VS("2", "H") = BENCH("PKH", "CONSH");
VS("1", "F") = BENCH("PLF", "CONSF");
VS("2", "F") = BENCH("PKF", "CONSF");

```

```

BETA("1", "1") = -BENCH("PLH", "XHH") / BENCH("PXH", "XHH");
BETA("1", "2") = -BENCH("PKH", "XHH") / BENCH("PXH", "XHH");
BETA("2", "1") = -BENCH("PLH", "YHH") / BENCH("PYH", "YHH");
BETA("2", "2") = -BENCH("PKH", "YHH") / BENCH("PYH", "YHH");

```

```

GAMMA("1")     = -BENCH("PXH", "UH") / BENCH("PUH", "UH");
GAMMA("2")     = -BENCH("PYH", "UH") / BENCH("PUH", "UH");

```

```

WELW("H") = BENCH("PUH", "UH") / (BENCH("PUH", "UH") + BENCH("PUF", "UF"));
WELW("F") = BENCH("PUF", "UF") / (BENCH("PUH", "UH") + BENCH("PUF", "UF"));

```

```

DISPLAY VS, BETA, GAMMA, WELW;

```

```

TC(I)      = 1.0001;

```


VARIABLES

JWELMAX joint welfare maximization
WELMAXH welfare of country H
WELMAXF welfare of country F
TR(I,C) tariff of country C on good I;

POSITIVE VARIABLES

X(I,C) Activity level for production of I by C
M(I,C) Activity level for imports of I by C
E(I,C) Activity level for exports of I by C
U(C) Activity level for sector U in country C

PX(I,C) Price of commodity I in country C
PW(I) World price of commodity I
PV(J,C) Price of factor J in country C
PU(C) Price of welfare (expenditure function) in country C

CONS(C) Aggregate income;

EQUATIONS

OBJJ
OBJH, OBJF
PRX(I,C) Zero profit for sector I in country J
PRM(I,C) Zero profit for imports of I by country j
PRE(I,C) Zero profit for exports of I by country j
PRU(C) Zero profit for sector U

MKX(I,C) Supply-demand balance for commodity I
 MKW(I) Supply-demand balance for imports and exports of I
 MKV(J,C) Supply-demand balance for primary factor V1
 MKU(C) Supply-demand balance for welfare (aggregate demand)

ICONS(C) Income definition for CONS;

OBJJ.. JWELMAX =E= **PROD**(C, U(C)**WELW(C));

OBJH.. WELMAXH =E= U("H");

OBJF.. WELMAXF =E= U("F");

* *Zero profit inequalities*

PRX(I,C).. **PROD**(J, PV(J,C)**BETA(I,J)) =G= PX(I,C);

PRM(I,C).. PW(I)*TC(I)*TR(I,C) =G= PX(I,C);

PRE(I,C).. PX(I,C) =G= PW(I);

PRU(C).. **PROD**(I, PX(I,C)**GAMMA(I)) =G= PU(C);

* *Market clearance inequalities*

MKX(I,C).. X(I,C) - E(I,C) + M(I,C)/TC(I) =G=

PROD(II, PX(II,C)**GAMMA(II))*(GAMMA(I)/PX(I,C))*U(C);

MKW(I).. **SUM**(C, E(I,C) - M(I,C)) =G= 0;

MKV(J,C).. VS(J,C) =G= **SUM**(I,
PROD(JJ, PV(JJ,C)**BETA(I,JJ))*(BETA(I,J)/PV(J,C))*X(I,C));

MKU(C).. U(C) =E= CONS(C) / PU(C);

* *Income balance equations*

ICONS(C).. CONS(C) =E= **SUM**(J, VS(J,C)*PV(J,C)) +
SUM(I, PW(I)*(TR(I,C) - 1)*M(I,C));

MODEL MCP /PRX.X, PRM.M, PRE.E, PRU.U,
MKX.PX, MKW.PW, MKV.PV, MKU.PU,
ICONS.CONS/;

MODEL MPEC /OBJJ, OBJH, OBJF, PRX.X, PRM.M, PRE.E, PRU.U,
MKX.PX, MKW.PW, MKV.PV, MKU.PU,
ICONS.CONS/;

PU.L(C) = 1;

PU.FX("H") = 1;

* *Set initial values of variables:*

```

X.L(I,C)          =100;
M.L(I,C)          =100;
E.L(I,C)          =100;
U.L(C)            =200;
PX.L(I,C)         =1;
PW.L(I)           =1;
PV.L(J,C)         =1;
PV.L(J,C)         =1;
CONS.L(C)         =200;
WELMAXH.L         =U.L("H");
WELMAXF.L         =U.L("F");
JWELMAX.L         = 1;

```

** fix tariffs at zero (meaning TR = 1) to solve for free trade*

```
TR.FX(I,C) = 1;
```

```
OPTION MPEC = nlpec;
```

```
SOLVE MPEC USING MPEC MAXMIZING JWELMAX;
```

```

RESULTS("WELJ", "FREETR") = JWELMAX.L/200;
RESULTS("WELH", "FREETR") = U.L("H")/200;
RESULTS("WELF", "FREETR") = U.L("F")/200;
RESULTS("TARIFFH", "FREETR") = TR.L("2", "H")-1;
RESULTS("TARIFFF", "FREETR") = TR.L("1", "F")-1;

```

DISPLAY RESULTS;

** show that this can be done with the mcp version when TR variables
* are fixed*

SOLVE MCP USING MCP;

TR.FX(I, "H") = 1.2;

SOLVE MCP USING MCP;

** solve for the optimal tariff for country h when TRF is still fixed
* at zero.*

TR.UP("2", "H") = +**INF**;

TR.LO("2", "H") = -**INF**;

SOLVE MPEC USING MPEC MAXIMIZING WELMAXH;

RESULTS("WELJ", "UNIH") = JWELMAX.L/200;

RESULTS("WELH", "UNIH") = U.L("H")/200;

RESULTS("WELF", "UNIH") = U.L("F")/200;

RESULTS("TARIFFH", "UNIH") = TR.L("2", "H")-1;

RESULTS("TARIFFF", "UNIH") = TR.L("1", "F")-1;

DISPLAY RESULTS;

**\$EXIT*

SETS K iterative procedure to determine Nash tariffs /K1*K10/;

TR.FX(I,C) = 1;

LOOP(K,

TR.UP("2", "H") = +**INF**;

TR.LO("2", "H") = -**INF**;

TR.FX("1", "F") = TR.L("1", "F");

SOLVE MPEC USING MPEC MAXIMIZING WELMAXH;

TR.UP("1", "F") = +**INF**;

TR.LO("1", "F") = -**INF**;

TR.FX("2", "H") = TR.L("2", "H");

SOLVE MPEC USING MPEC MAXIMIZING WELMAXF;

);

RESULTS("WELJ", "NASH") = JWELMAX.L/200;

RESULTS("WELH", "NASH") = U.L("H")/200;

RESULTS("WELF", "NASH") = U.L("F")/200;

RESULTS("TARIFFH", "NASH") = TR.L("2", "H")-1;

RESULTS("TARIFFF", "NASH") = TR.L("1", "F")-1;

DISPLAY RESULTS;

```
$LIBINCLUDE XLDUMP RESULTS M8.XLS SHEET2!A3
```